Responses to 9-8-19 drafts of Statutes and revised Introduction

BALTIMORE: 18 November 2019

To the LT From Baltimore Carmel Re Approval of the new statutes for CCA

We very much appreciate your due diligence regarding the drafting of the new CCA statutes. You have taken your responsibility very seriously and we can understand your desire to have the matter resolved before you leave office. Thank you for all the work you have done.

We are still particularly concerned about having a three-year term of office for the leadership team. As you may remember, CCA tried a three-year term in 2009 and found it did not work for our Association. The delegate Assembly rejected the three-year term and returned to two. Ten years ago the three-year term was untenable when communities were younger and larger. How can this work now? As a community that has regularly given a member to the leadership team, going with a three-year term of office is of particular concern for us.

Accordingly, we suggest that it is advisable or even necessary to slow down the process. As in civil law, there are different philosophical approaches to church law. Not all canonists will give the same advice to the LT that Sr. Nancy did. We would like to suggest that you speak with Dr. Diane Barr who is the chancellor of our Archdiocese. She has a somewhat different view about the speed with which we need to send revised statutes to Rome and how strictly we conform to the Congregation's requirements.

This is such a serious matter that we think it deserves a thoughtful formal discussion at the 2020 meeting and are, therefore, requesting that it be put on the agenda of the Delegate Assembly. We realize that the schedule is already very full, but this is a matter of major concern with real implications for our communities and we need to do everything that we can to facilitate adequate consideration of the issues involved. We also think that it might be helpful to invite Dr. Barr to join in that conversation at the meeting so that all of us can benefit from her expertise and experience before deciding on our next steps. We believe that we need the discernment of the whole memberships on this.

We know the majority of the communities have already accepted the revisions. While that is true at a certain level, we believe it is only because as a group we have not fully understood our options. Cleveland wrote, "We assume that these items cannot be changed much." If that is the underlying assumption of some of our communities, then, of course, they will only suggest changing the things that they find the most egregious. We have been advised that Cardinal Carballo and the Congregation are eager to address the actual needs of religious in this country and are not necessarily stuck in thinking that this is how things have to be. They are just using the models they have known.

Legal scholars tell us that *law follows life*. That is to say that the way people live shapes the law; it is a codification of what is actually being done. Some of these laws do not reflect the way that we actually live our lives and while we can accept some of them, others, like the three year term of office for leadership and the 5-6 years of temporary

vows, <u>are</u> untenable. As far as we know, Rome has set no deadline for approving these statutes. We think that it is better to move a little more slowly toward requesting approval of our statutes. Rome has always moved very slowly in this regard. Let us use that to our advantage.

BARRINGTON

BEACON: 14 November 2019

On the whole we accept the changes you have made -- you did listen to the prior feedback!

We'd like to recommend just a few word changes, and the addition of something.

Words: in the proposed introduction, we'd like to see in par.2 third line, omit mention of "communion" since that was not how we expressed ourselves at first, then insert it in the third paragraph "deepening our communion.." since that is how we talk now.

Changes: in 2nd par. of the introduction, omit mention of the Charter of Life. That was one particular program and there are others not mentioned. Have the sentence read, "We developed programs for ..."

Addition: under the duties of the president, add to k. " to request an eldercare or financial consultation from the appropriate national office, NRRO or RCRI." (These offices are very helpful; I was surprised that some of our Carmels who could well use it have not had an eldercare consultation.)

As you can see, the first two are mostly word changes; I think the last is substantive. Thanks again for all you do for us!

BOSTON: 30 October 2019

Re the 2nd working draft, we found it all acceptable.

Re the Cleveland Introduction: We prefer the simplicity of the original (1993), but would like to see the last sentence in the 2nd paragraph of Cleveland's included. "The values of sisterly love...." We didn't like the idea of beginning with a date. There was also the feeling that the introduction should be 'timeless/classic' rather than trying to make it speak to "our current reality"

Re the original: In the 3rd sentence, the word 'corporate' used after collaborative is repetitive, and in the last sentence it is unnecessary. This sentence could begin with "Within the one Teresian charism..."

CLEVELAND: 14 November 2019

Our community approves the draft as presented by the LT, including the three year term, in the interest of not being assigned a 6 year term by Rome. Thank you for the revised introduction too.

CONCORD: 14 November 2019 Notes on the 2nd draft of the new CCA Constitutions Document mostly very good. We had a few questions.

III. 15: "three to five years of Temporary Profession"-- Is this in accordance with Cor Orans? They said 9 to 12 years in initial formation. We counted: 1 year of postulancy, 2 years of novitiate, then 3 to 5 years of Temporary Profession would equal 6 to 8 years rather than 9 to 12. We don't mind the time being shortened, though.

III. 16: on the death of the President of the Council: Why would all the Councilors have to be re-elected if the President's death or incapacity necessitates an Extraordinary General Assembly? Wouldn't it be enough to elect a new president?

Also: Who takes charge in the meantime between the Pres's death and the EGA? III. 17 b: on sisterly visits and mutual support: Need to specify how the delegates are chosen. By the Council? The President? The communities of CCA? On a volunteer basis?

Otherwise OK and a lesson in Canon Law to read!

DANVILLE: 22 November 2019

Our Community is grateful for the work on the updating already accomplished and have no recommendations to make now.

We do look forward to the compilation of responses when it is ready.

Thank you and all for your work on this.

ELDRIDGE: 13 November 2019

Eldridge Carmel has read and discussed the draft for the revised CCA statutes. We support the document (the 2nd draft) and we thank you all who worked hard to get it done.

LATROBE: 6 November 2019

Re: 9-8-19 Proposed new Introduction to CCA Statutes

On February 2, 1970 an Association of Carmelite Nuns was formed in the United States. The primary aim and purpose was to deepen and develop the Teresian contemplative life in the contemporary church and world in response to the call of Vatican II for the renewal and adaptation of religious life. This doesn't seem historically accurate, since the 1993 introduction states otherwise. It is overlaying present "concepts" on an historical situation. The primary purpose was for "the need and desire for unity". We hadn't gotten to: "was to deepen and develop the Teresian contemplative life in the contemporary church and world" just yet. We suggest omitting all but the first sentence and adding it to the paragraph below: Several years later we formally named ourselves ("became"?) Carmelite Communities Associated (CCA). Our Association grew out of a desire to respond to the Holy See's directives regarding federation of contemplative communities for the purpose of communion, collaboration and mutual assistance. We developed a 'Charter of Life,' programs for initial and ongoing formation, and grew in unity and in mutual acceptance of our diversity. The values of sisterly love, understanding, mutual respect, and our common commitment to the Teresian charism are fundamental to giving life to our Association and to the structures set forth in these Statutes. As our member communities face the challenges of contemplative religious life in the 21st century, we are fully committed to living our Carmelite charism and Gospel values. We renew our vitality through deepening our relationships with each other by way of online and in-person meetings, strengthening mutual practical support, nurturing

unity and collaboration with the Carmelite family, and reflecting the prophetic voice of the Carmelite charism in our witness of faith and hope in the Triune God.

LATROBE: 6 NOVEMBER 2019— 2nd draft of updating Statutes—9-8-2019 Latrobe's comments will be in italics

I'm going to follow the format used by Baltimore and Reno and insert our comments into the text

Section I. NATURE

3. In order to join the Association, a two-thirds vote of the Chapter of the petitioning Monastery and the acceptance by the President and Council of the Association are necessary. The President and Council must consult with member monasteries before giving acceptance (we suggest the word "will" rather than "must" since the end result is the same but it doesn't sound so heavy –handed)

III A—Latrobe responded to Baltimore's recommendation in comments to 1st draft: "We also recommend adding a new section IV to address formation, as follows: IV. Duration of Temporary Vows in the Monasteries of the Association. 1. Sisters shall be evaluated for Solemn Profession after 3 to 5 years of temporary vows, and admitted to Solemn Profession by the Prioress at the discretion of the Formators and Chapter. 2.A specific program will be developed for each sister's support and personal guidance for 3 to 5 years following Solemn Profession" Latrobe responded.

III A

We feel this addition or something similar could be a helpful way to move these decisions from Rome to the Association

- 15. a. Duration of Temporary Vows in the Monasteries of the Association: Sisters shall be evaluated for Solemn Profession after 3 to 5 years of temporary vows and admitted to Solemn Profession by the Prioress with the consent of the Chapter;
- b. Sisters Recently Solemnly Professed: for support and personal guidance of Sisters for 3 to 5 years following solemn Profession, it is recommended that each community develop a mentoring program for their Sisters. This maybe done, as needed, in collaboration with the Association leadership, other CCA communities and other Associations

III A

13. The General Assembly cannot proceed with its elections and deliberations unless all the members have been convoked and at least two-thirds of them are present. (is clarification needed here? Does "present" mean PHYSICALLY present, or will Zoom attendance also be accepted with equal validity?

III B

Leadership: The term of President and Councilors shall be three years with a possible second term of three years. We agree with the LT that we should stick with Three years for the reasons given by the LT and the Boston community [in their feedback to 1st draft]

17. d. To visit member Monasteries at any time the need requires it or when such a visit is requested by a member community; a Councilor, or delegate, *(this addition* – delegate - *is fine with us)* may accompany her as a Co-Visitator along with the Association Treasurer, as needed;

Note: Latrobe responded to a question raised by Reno communities response to 1st draft: "A question: Does our non-profit legal status require us to have a dissolution clause?" We don't see a need for this in the statutes since it is a Church document. We do see the value of it, however, in our 501(c)3 corporation papers, if it is not already there

OLDENBURG:

RENO: 13 November 2019

- 1. Reno accepts the proposed new Introduction to CCA Statutes as is.
- 2. Our community doesn't agree with everything in the updating of our Statutes, yet we did agree that it is the best we can do at this time with what Cor orans has given us. We think it important to streamline in anyway possible rather than duplicate what is already in Cor orans. We, as community members and as members of CCA, have lived through many documents sent by Rome and continue to be enlivened by the Spirit who gives life! Let us not get bogged down in juridical details as we live our Teresian charism in diverse and rich ways.
- 3. On top of p. 3 of working draft of Statutes III A #15 we recommend that "b" be omitted. Details of how our Communities and Association will support our recently Solemnly Professed sisters are not a necessary part of our Statutes. We do support finding ways of working together and sharing delegated responsibilities and our Association Goals have reflected this.
- 4. On p. 3 of working draft of Statutes III B #17: to simplify this section, we recommend that we keep "a" and "b" because they are in the spirit of our Association, especially because we previously added "or delegates" in "b".
- 5. On p. 3 & 4 of working draft of Statutes III B #17 we recommend deleting "c thru i" and instead refer to the #s of requirements of Cor orans for the duties of the President.
- 6. On p. 4 of working draft of Statutes III B #18 we recommend changing the wording of "e" to read: To share responsibilities with the President in implementing decisions

made by the General Assembly, in planning other General Assemblies, and in appropriate delegation of responsibilities for the benefit of the Association.

- 7. On p. 5 of working draft of Statutes III D #20, we recommend changing the wording of "b" to read To retain the documents of the Association, including decisions made by the General Assembly and keep archives updated.
- 8. As a community we also reflected on the unexpected additional work that Cor orans has placed on both the CCA "President" and "Council" which has impacted our current LT. We know that this may have an impact on those who may be willing to serve on LT next term. Perhaps there could be a conversation among CCA members on a Zoom to explore ways of delegating some of LT responsibilities—this also came up during Ann and Susan's sisterly visit to Baltimore.

SAN RAFAEL